



**Saddle River School District - Wandell School**  
**97 East Allendale Road, Saddle River, NJ 07458**  
201.327.0727      www.wandellschool.org      Fax: 201.236.8166



October 30, 2023

**VIA E-MAIL [opra+request-54301-0ba5c4ba@requests.opramachine.com]**  
**Brian Hampel**

*Re: Open Public Records Act/Common Law Request*

Dear Mr. Hampel:

The Saddle River School District (“District”) records custodian received your Open Public Records Act (“OPRA”) and common law request (“Request”) on October 19, 2023. The seven business day deadline to respond to your Request is October 30, 2023. As such, the District is timely responding to your Request in accordance with New Jersey law.

Your Request seeks the following records:

*Please provide copies of any send/receive agreements proposed by the Saddle River Board of Education (BOE) to Allendale, HoHoKus, Upper Saddle River, or any other districts in 2023, along with their corresponding responses from each district.*

With respect to the portion of your Request seeking copies of any proposed send/receive agreements, please be advised that the District conducted a good-faith search and determined it is not in possession of any potentially responsive records.

With respect to the portion of your Request seeking corresponding responses from each district, please be advised that this item is invalid as overly broad. Both New Jersey courts and the GRC have upheld an established criteria deemed necessary to specifically identify and facilitate a search for responsive e-mails and other written communications. See Armenti v. Robbinsville Bd. of Educ., GRC Complaint No. 2009-154 (Interim Order May 24, 2011); see also Zahler v. Ocean County College, GRC Complaint No. 2013-266 (Jan. 2016).

In Elcavage v. West Milford Township, GRC Complaint No. 2009-07 and 2009-08 (April 2010), the GRC determined that in accordance with legal precedent: “[I]n order to specifically identify an e-mail the OPRA request must contain (1) the content and/or subject of the e-mail, (2) the specific date or range of dates during which the e-mail was transmitted or the e-mails were transmitted, and (3) **identification of the sender and/or the recipient thereof.**” Requests seeking correspondence but omitting specific senders and/or recipients are invalid. See Lewis-Gallagher v. Monroe Twp. Pub. Sch. Dist., GRC Complaint No. 2018-8 (Sept. 2019); see also Shipyard Associates, L.P. v. City of Hoboken, 2015 WL 10352982 (App. Div. 2015) (holding, in part, that a request for correspondence received by the public entity’s employees, agents, or City Council lacked the requisite level of specificity because it failed to provide the names of any of the entity’s employees or agents); see also Burke v. Ocean Cty., 2013 WL 6169154 (App. Div. 2013) (holding that an OPRA request is not the equivalent of lawsuit

discovery). As such, to the extent that you seek correspondence between the District and the Allendale, Ho-Ho-Kus, and/or Upper Saddle River School Districts, this portion of your request is not sufficient for the District to search for and identify potentially responsive records.

Notwithstanding the invalidity of this portion of your Request, in the interest of transparency the District conducted a good-faith search and identified 18 pages of records as potentially responsive. The table below identifies the records that are being denied, in whole or in part, as well as the legal basis for each denial, as required by N.J.S.A. 47:1A-6.

| <b>List of all records provided, with <u>redactions</u>, or <u>denied in their entirety</u>.</b>                   | <b>If records are <u>disclosed with redactions</u>, give a general nature description of the redactions.</b> | <b>If records were <u>denied in their entirety</u>, give a general nature description of the record.</b> | <b>List the legal explanation and statutory citation for the denial of access to records in their <u>entirety</u> or <u>with redactions</u>.</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| E-mail correspondence from Dr. Gina Cinotti to Dr. Michael Barcadepone re: MS Exploration dated September 15, 2023 |                                                                                                              | Deliberative process privilege                                                                           | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." See <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u> (exempting inter-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a "government record"). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. See <u>Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). |
| E-mail correspondence from Dr. Michael Barcadepone to Dr. Gina Cinotti re: MS Exploration dated September 15, 2023 |                                                                                                              | Deliberative process privilege                                                                           | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." See <u>N.J.S.A. 47:1A-1.1</u> (exempting inter-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a "government record"). The                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |

|                                                                                                               |  |                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                                                                                               |  |                                | correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. See <u>Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000).                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| E-mail correspondence from Dr. Gina Cinotti to Dr. Diane G. Mardy re: MS Exploration dated September 15, 2023 |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." See <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting inter-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a "government record"). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. See <u>Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). |
| E-mail correspondence from Dr. Gina Cinotti to Dr. Diane G. Mardy re: MS Exploration dated September 20, 2023 |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." See <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting inter-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a "government record"). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. See <u>Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the</u>                                                             |

|                                                                                                                                  |  |                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                                                                                                                  |  |                                | <u>Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000).                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| E-mail correspondence from Dr. Diane G. Mardy to Dr. Gina Cinotti re: MS Exploration dated September 20, 2023                    |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." See <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting inter-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a "government record"). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. See <u>Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). |
| E-mail correspondence from John Peros to Dr. Gina Cinotti, Emily Kaufman, and Kaitlyn Lawler re: Projections dated June 13, 2023 |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." See <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting intra-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a "government record"). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. See <u>Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). |
| E-mail correspondence from Mary Ellen Nye to John Peros re:                                                                      |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." See <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |

|                                                                                           |  |                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Projections dated June 13, 2023                                                           |  |                                | (exempting inter-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a “government record”). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. <u>See Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep’t of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000).                                                                                                                                  |
| E-mail correspondence from Mary Ellen Nye to John Peros re: Projections dated May 2, 2023 |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District’s “deliberative process privilege.” <u>See N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting inter-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a “government record”). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. <u>See Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep’t of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). |
| E-mail correspondence from John Peros to Mary Ellen Nye re: Projections dated May 2, 2023 |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District’s “deliberative process privilege.” <u>See N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting inter-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a “government record”). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and                                                                                                                                                                                              |

|                                                                                                                                           |  |                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                                                                                                                           |  |                                | deliberative in nature. <u>See Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000).                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| E-mail correspondence from Kaitlyn Lawler to Dr. Gina Cinotti re: Projections dated June 13, 2023                                         |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." <u>See N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting intra-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a "government record"). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. <u>See Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). |
| E-mail correspondence from Dr. Gina Cinotti to John Peros, copied to Emily Kaufman and Kaitlyn Lawler re: Projections dated June 13, 2023 |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." <u>See N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting intra-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a "government record"). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. <u>See Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). |

|                                                                                                                                           |  |                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| E-mail correspondence from John Peros to Dr. Gina Cinotti, copied to Emily Kaufman and Kaitlyn Lawler re: Projections dated June 13, 2023 |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." See <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting intra-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a "government record"). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. See <u>Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). |
| E-mail correspondence from Dr. Gina Cinotti to John Peros, copied to Emily Kaufman and Kaitlyn Lawler re: Projections dated June 13, 2023 |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." See <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting intra-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a "government record"). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. See <u>Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). |
| E-mail correspondence from John Peros to Dr. Gina Cinotti, copied to Emily Kaufman and Kaitlyn                                            |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." See <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting intra-agency advisory, consultative, or                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |

|                                                                                                |  |                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Lawler re: Middle School dated April 21, 2023                                                  |  |                                | deliberative material from the definition of a “government record”). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. <u>See Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep’t of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000).                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| E-mail correspondence from Mary Ellen Nye to John Peros re: Middle School dated April 20, 2023 |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District’s “deliberative process privilege.” <u>See N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting inter-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a “government record”). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. <u>See Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep’t of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). |
| E-mail correspondence from John Peros to Mary Ellen Nye re: Middle School dated March 3, 2023  |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District’s “deliberative process privilege.” <u>See N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting inter-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a “government record”). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. <u>See Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep’t</u>                                                                                                                              |

|                                                                                                                                              |  |                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                                                                                                                              |  |                                | of Educ., 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000).                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| E-mail correspondence from Kaitlyn Lawler to John Peros, copied to Dr. Gina Cinotti and Emily Kaufman re: Middle School dated April 21, 2023 |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." See <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting intra-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a "government record"). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. See <u>Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). |
| E-mail correspondence from Dr. Gina Cinotti to Kaitlyn Lawler, copied to John Peros and Emily Kaufman re: Middle School dated April 21, 2023 |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." See <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting intra-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a "government record"). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. See <u>Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). |

|                                                                                                                                              |  |                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| E-mail correspondence from John Peros to Dr. Gina Cinotti, copied to Emily Kaufman and Kaitlyn Lawler re: Middle School dated April 21, 2023 |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." See <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting intra-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a "government record"). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. See <u>Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). |
| E-mail correspondence from Kaitlyn Lawler to Dr. Gina Cinotti re: Middle School dated April 25, 2023                                         |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." See <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting intra-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a "government record"). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. See <u>Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). |
| E-mail correspondence from Kaitlyn Lawler to John Peros, copied to Dr. Gina Cinotti and Emily                                                |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." See <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting intra-agency advisory, consultative, or                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |

|                                                                                                    |  |                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Kaufman re: Middle School dated May 1, 2023                                                        |  |                                | deliberative material from the definition of a “government record”). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. <u>See Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep’t of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000).                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| E-mail correspondence from Dr. Gina Cinotti to Dr. Diane Mardy re: Middle School dated May 1, 2023 |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District’s “deliberative process privilege.” <u>See N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting inter-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a “government record”). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. <u>See Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep’t of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). |
| E-mail correspondence from Dr. Diane Mardy to Dr. Gina Cinotti re: Middle School dated May 1, 2023 |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District’s “deliberative process privilege.” <u>See N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting inter-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a “government record”). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. <u>See Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep’t</u>                                                                                                                              |

|                                                                                                                                                               |  |                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                                                                                                                                               |  |                                                              | of Educ., 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000).                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| E-mail correspondence from John Peros to Dr. Gina Cinotti, Matthew J. Giacobbe, Esq., Kaitlyn Lawler and Emily Kaufman re: Middle School dated March 20, 2023 |  | Deliberative process privilege;<br>attorney-client privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." See <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting intra-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a "government record"). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. See <u>Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). This correspondence is also being withheld pursuant to the District's attorney-client privilege. See <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting "any record within the attorney-client privilege" from the definition of a "government record"). This correspondence clearly reflects communication between the District and its counsel exchanged in the course of the lawyer-client relationship and in professional confidence. |
| E-mail correspondence from Mary Ellen Nye to John Peros re: Middle                                                                                            |  | Deliberative process privilege                               | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." See <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |

|                                                                                                                                                                          |  |                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| School dated March 18, 2023                                                                                                                                              |  |                                | (exempting inter-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a “government record”). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. <u>See Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep’t of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000).                                                                                                                                  |
| E-mail correspondence from Dr. Gina Cinotti to John Peros, copied to Matthew J. Giacobbe, Esq., Kaitlyn Lawler, and Emily Kaufman re: Middle School dated March 21, 2023 |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District’s “deliberative process privilege.” <u>See N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting intra-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a “government record”). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. <u>See Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep’t of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). |
| E-mail correspondence from Dr. Gina Cinotti to Dr. Brad Siegel re: Follow Up from Before Vacation dated April 10, 2023                                                   |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District’s “deliberative process privilege.” <u>See N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting inter-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a “government record”). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and                                                                                                                                                                                              |

|                                                                                                                        |  |                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                                                                                                        |  |                                | deliberative in nature. <u>See Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000).                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| E-mail correspondence from Dr. Brad Siegel to Dr. Gina Cinotti re: Follow Up from Before Vacation dated April 11, 2023 |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." <u>See N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting inter-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a "government record"). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. <u>See Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). |
| E-mail correspondence from Dr. Gina Cinotti to Dr. Brad Siegel dated September 15, 2023                                |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." <u>See N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting inter-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a "government record"). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. <u>See Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). |

|                                                                                         |  |                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| E-mail correspondence from Dr. Gina Cinotti to Dr. Brad Siegel dated September 20, 2023 |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." See <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting inter-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a "government record"). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. See <u>Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). |
| E-mail correspondence from Dr. Brad Siegel to Dr. Gina Cinotti dated September 25, 2023 |  | Deliberative process privilege | This correspondence has been redacted pursuant to the District's "deliberative process privilege." See <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 47:1A-1.1 (exempting inter-agency advisory, consultative, or deliberative material from the definition of a "government record"). The correspondence at issue is pre-decisional and deliberative in nature. See <u>Educ. Law Ctr. v. N.J. Dep't of Educ.</u> , 198 N.J. 274, 286 (2009); <u>In the Matter of the Liquidation of Integrity Ins. Co.</u> , 165 N.J. 75, 88 (2000). |

To the extent that you have submitted your Request under the common law right of access, your Request is also denied. In O'Boyle v. Borough of Longport, 218 N.J. 168, 196 (2014), the Supreme Court of New Jersey held that the party requesting documents under the common law right of access must explain why he seeks access to the requested documents. See also Gannett Satellite Information Network, LLC v. Twp. of Neptune, 254 N.J. 242 (2023) (holding that the person seeking access must establish an interest in the subject matter of the material). Here, your Request lacks any explanation with respect to your purported interest in accessing the information at issue. Notwithstanding, even if you had explained your precise interest in accessing the information, your Request would still be deficient for the reasons set forth above.

Your Request is now deemed answered and closed. Thank you for your attention to this matter.

Sincerely,



Kaitlyn Lawler  
Board Secretary